Resource Sharing Challenges in the WTBF

A Practitioners View of the Resource Sharing Process

• Ewan Colquhoun, Director, Ridge Partners
  ewan@ridgepartners.com.au

• Geoff Diver, Tuna West: Indian Ocean Tuna Association,
  geoff.diver@bigpond.com
3 Parts to this Presentation

1. What was available to work with

2. Moving Forward – the facilitated process

3. Requirements for Effective Resource Sharing
1. Working with PEOPLE

It’s about people, history, their expectations, etc

……..with significant financial investments, and passion about what they do

How to get traction on process: trust depends on

– transparency of process,
– empathy with credible arguments,
– honesty regarding expectations, and
– fair dealing with facts.

But……….stalemate had been reached
2. GEOGRAPHY, OCEANOGRAPHY, BATHYMETRY
3. SPECIES, METHODS, SEASONALITY

Key species of common interest
- pelagic tuna and tuna like species
- key overlap - striped marlin, yellowfin tuna
- lesser overlap - bigeye tuna, broadbill swordfish
- blue and black marlin - recreational only

Methods - longline and purse seine, plus minor line

Seasonality
- commercial year round, focus on YFT and STM in summer
- recreational highly seasonal: peaks in the south in summer, and the north in winter.
4. FISHERY MANAGEMENT THEORY

Recreationalists

- strike rates of trophy sized fish are greatest.
- want biomass at 70-80%.

Commericals

- harvest the fishery to maintain maximum sustainable yield.
- want biomass at 40-60%.

Fishery Managers

- want biomass at 50-70%.
- want biomass above 50%.

interaction of highly pelagic species with this theory makes predictable biomass and strike outcomes less certain.
5. ORGANISATIONS

**Recreationals**
- 658,000 State fishers
  - Recfish Australia
  - Aust Nat’l Sportfish Ass’n
  - Aust Fish. Clubs Ass’n
- 1,000 game fishers with capacity to access edge of shelf
- 17 gamefish clubs
  - Bussleton to Broome
  - 2000kms

**Indigenous fisher effort in WTBF is insignificant**

**Commercials**
- Indian Ocean Tuna Ass’n
- Australian Fishing Zone
- 124 longline permits in WTBF
- active longliners
  - 1997 - 5
  - 2001 - 46
  - 2003 - 27
  - 2005 - 2

**WA Game Fishing Ass’n**

**Tuna West**

- high global oil prices
- global market prices for tuna
- lack of crews - mining
6. HISTORY - Fact and Expectation

- 1949 - WA Game Fishing Association formed
- 1952 - 1997 Foreign vessels
- 1979 Australian Fishing Zone – 200nm
- 1998 Declaration of Black and Blue Marlin
- 2002 Coolangatta resource sharing principles

- Important re interpretation of access rights
  - Did either party have a pre-existing right to fish based on historical usage?
  - Is this allocation of rights or reallocation of rights?
  - Is there a trigger for compensation to any party?
7. DATA - Fact and Assumption

- Good data is critical to negotiation process
  - Environmental, Social + Economic
  - limit adverse impacts by setting initial 5 year initial agreement
- Commercial data – good, but bit patchy
  - IOTC / AFZ – degree of stock mixing not clear
  - AFMA comprehensive since 1984
  - GVP $34 - $8 million (2004);
  - limited economic/ subeconomy impact analysis
- Recreational data– poor and patchy
  - growth – urban centres and marine park pressures
  - demonstrable recreational fishing hot spots
  - club and seasonality data available, but not comprehensive
  - limited economic / subeconomy impact analysis
Sample Commercial Data

Striped marlin

Australia
Japan

Catch (tonnes)

MOVING FORWARD
Facilitated Process

• Goodwill from DAFF guided process stalemate - Records of meetings available
• Consultation with all parties
• Data access, and clarified where possible
• Establish Negotiation Positions
  – Leeuwin Current variable in space, time and intensity
  – agreed 100% of impact within 200m + 25nm on shelf; species ???
  – longline drift – north/south/east/west
  – hotspots for both – Abrolhos Is, Rowley Shoals, Exmouth, Rottnest Trench
  – corridor closure v’s port bubbles
• Options for DAF / Minister Decision 13 Oct 2005
Ministerial Decision

**Option 3c - Winter**

Winter - April to October
- Year-round exclusion of commercial fishing, except purse seineing, prawn trawling, and prawn seineing in the 200m isobath for the northern part of Exmouth and Broom and for 15nm to the north of the 200m isobath for the southern part of Exmouth and Broom and for 15nm to the north of the 200m isobath for the northern part of Exmouth and Broom and for 15nm to the north of the 200m isobath for the southern part of Exmouth and Broom.

**Option 3c - Summer**

Summer - November to March
- Year-round exclusion of commercial fishing, except purse seineing, prawn trawling, and prawn seineing in the 200m isobath for the northern part of Exmouth and Broom and for 15nm to the north of the 200m isobath for the southern part of Exmouth and Broom.

**FEATURE**
- Exclusion Zone, North
- Exmouth Region Hot Spot 50nm
- Rowley Shoals Hot Spot 15nm
- Atalache Hot Spot 15nm
- Perth Canyon Hot Spot 15nm
- 200m isobath
REQUIREMENTS FOR EFFECTIVE RESOURCE SHARING

1. Defined policy framework
2. Clarity on any pre-existing rights – all parties
3. Good data re:
   – the marine environment
   – the biomass for target and bycatch species
   – catch and effort - all users, key species, all methods
   – social + economic costs and benefits – direct + indirect
   – resourcing capacity of stakeholders
4. Organisational cohesion and capacity
5. Resourcing of process
6. Timing: fit dynamics of industry, process not drawn out
7. Independent facilitation available to assist
   – to establish and maintain the integrity of and trust in the negotiation process